

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

TIME	ITEM
5:00 p.m.	Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) members met to complete the Valuation Tools.
7:10 p.m.	<p>Welcome/Opening Remarks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Ann Sutton, Superintendent of Education, introduced herself as Chair and thanked everyone for attending.
7:10 p.m.	<p>Opening Prayer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Ms. Sutton opened the meeting with prayer. ▪ Housekeeping issues were addressed: tripping hazards, beverages, washrooms, emergency exits, etc.
7:17 p.m.	<p>Introductions – Ms. Sutton</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The members of the ARC introduced themselves. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Maureen Beauregard, ARC member representing St. Patrick's Catholic High School ○ Elaine Hayter, ARC member representing St. Patrick's Catholic High School ○ Jane Spanton, ARC member representing St. Patrick's Catholic High School ○ Caroline Brant, ARC member representing St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School ○ Janet Chynces, ARC member representing St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School ○ Candice Etienne, ARC member representing St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School ○ Fr. Matthew Bedard, ARC member representing the parishes ○ Robert Kardas, Dean of Business and Sports Administration at Lambton College, community representative ○ Jack Evers, Prime Minister of St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School student council, representing students (non-voting member) ○ Brenda Thompson, Deputy Prime Minister of St. Patrick's Catholic High School student council, representing students (non-voting member) ○ Bernadette Gray, Principal, St. Patrick's Catholic High School, resource to the committee ○ Brendan Deery, Principal, St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School, resource to the committee ○ Fred Galloway, F.J. Galloway Associates, board consultant, facilitator and resource to the committee ▪ The roles of voting and non-voting ARC members were explained. ▪ Senior board staff, who are acting as resources to the ARC, were introduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Jim McKenzie, Associate Director – Corporate Services and Treasurer ○ Bruch Hannah, Manager – Facility Services ○ Karen Dolson, Coordinator – Planning Services ○ Brenda Courey, Assistant Superintendent – Catholic Curriculum (Secondary) ○ Martin Forster, Principal – Special Education ▪ Trustees were introduced

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Ms. Sutton provided a brief overview of the accommodation review process relative to Ministry of Education guidelines and board policy.
<p>7:19 p.m.</p>	<p>Rules of Order</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All audience members should register their attendance on forms outside of the gym. ▪ The rules of order, as outlined in the agenda, will be followed. <p>Notes of the meetings Notes will be taken by two recording secretaries and will be placed on the website within 10 working days after the meeting. The notes are not a verbatim transcript of the meeting.</p> <p>Protocols</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Meeting protocols, as outlined in the agenda, will be followed. <p>Questions arising from Presentations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ ARC members may ask questions at the end of each presentation. ▪ One hour at the end of the meeting will be allotted for questions from the audience. Each person who wishes to ask a question will be allotted two minutes to do so.
<p>7:20 p.m.</p>	<p>Presentation of the January 20, 2009 notes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ These were posted on the board website within 10 days of the last meeting and the ARC members have hard copies of these in their packages. ▪ The responses to questions from the January 20, 2009 meeting, which required additional research from board resource personnel, were reviewed by Ms. Sutton. ▪ In response to a request by the ARC members at the January 20, 2009 meeting, Ms. Courey gave a short presentation on the essential programs, which are offered in our secondary school as a requirement of the Ministry of Education. <p>Questions from ARC members arising from previous meeting</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There were no questions.
<p>7:40 p.m.</p>	<p>Results of the Valuation Process – Mr. Fred Galloway</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Voting members of the ARC have completed the valuation tool this evening.

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

- The tabulated results are:

Category	Points	St. Patrick's	St. Christopher
Value to the Students	45	38	43
Value to the Board	25	16	23
Value to the Community	20	19	17
Value to the Local Economy	10	9	9
Total	100	82	92

7:50 p.m.

Considering the Options - Fred Galloway

- Mr. Galloway presented a PowerPoint presentation.
- Two types of considerations need to be addressed:
 - Tier one - strategic direction for the schools and the board
 - Tier two – cultural and legacy issues.
- One school options were reviewed.
- Two school options were reviewed.
- Mr. Galloway presented an Alternative Matrix Table.

- **Questions from ARC members**
 - **Question** – Ms. Hayter – On the Alternative Matrix, why under the *Two School Alternatives*, is *Two Grade 7 to 12 schools* shown as an option? It was my understanding that due to the very small percentage of interest in this model that it would not be considered as an option.
 - **Response** – Ms. Sutton - Mr. Galloway was asked to have all options on the matrix

- Mr. Galloway asked if there were some options on the Alternative Matrix which the ARC members were now prepared to remove as options.
- Ms. Etienne - under the *One School Alternative the St. Christopher / St. Anne's Campus* option should be removed. Removed by consensus of the ARC.
- Ms. Chynces – the ARC decided not to do anything which would affect the elementary schools therefore, under the *Two School Alternative the Two Grade 7 to 12 Schools* and the *One Grade 7 to 9 School* and *One Grade 10 to 12 School* options should be removed. Removed by consensus of the ARC.
- Mr. Kardas – Under the *One School Alternative the Greenfield School* should be removed.
 - **Question** - Ms. Beauregard – Not enough discussion by the ARC regarding these options. Where will the money come from if the decision is to either renovate or to build a new school?
 - **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – Based on the current funding model the Ministry would not support this decision and the Board would be required to fund the whole amount.
- The *Greenfield School* option was removed by consensus of the ARC.

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

- Ms. Chynces – Under the *Two School Alternatives* the *Integrated Catholic/Public Secondary School* option should be removed. Removed by consensus of the ARC.
- Mr. Galloway asked if there were any other options which the ARC would like to recommend and discuss.
- Ms. Chynces – If we are considering the option of *Consolidate at St. Patrick's* we need to know if this will be cost effective due to the renovations and repairs which the site will require.
- Ms. Beauregard - would like to explore *Consolidate at St. Patrick's* option further.
- Ms. Etienne and Fr. Matthew would like to further explore *Sustain Current Two Schools with Upgrades*
- Ms. Hayter – *Sustain Current Two Schools with Upgrades* and *Build a Smaller New / Adapt an Existing Building* to sustain a Catholic Secondary School in South Sarnia seem to be very similar.
- Ms. Chynces – Would like to separate *Build a Smaller New / Adapt an Existing Building* to sustain a Catholic secondary school in south Sarnia into two separate options – to build a smaller, new school on the current St. Patrick's site as one option and adapt an existing building on a site other than St. Patrick's as a second option.
- Fr. Matthew – Would like to consider a primary campus secondary school at the St. Christopher site with a satellite campus in south Sarnia as an additional option.
 - **Question** - Ms. Etienne – if we choose to build a Smaller New School would we be creating two distinct schools or is the new build to be a satellite campus?
 - **Response** – Mr. Galloway – This would be one distinct school with a satellite campus or two distinct schools, which was the original intent of this recommendation.
- Fr. Matthew and Ms. Beauregard would like further discussion on this option.

Discussion of remaining options

- **Question** - Fr. Bedard – regarding consolidation of 2 schools into one existing school – could we run two 9-12 schools out of one building with different set of timetables to allow for overcrowding? Is there a regulatory framework around the start and end times of the school day?
- **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – does not know of any such regulations. – Ms. Sutton – not aware of any regulations regarding start and end times of the school day.
- **Ms. Hayter** – if that model is used it would negate sports, clubs and most extracurricular activities for students.
- **Question** - Mr. Kardas – is this option being considered due to the capacity issue which will occur when two schools are consolidated?
- **Response** – Fr. Matthew – we need to offer quality, faith-filled education to the students of Lambton County. The consolidation of two schools might be a way of providing this. We are looking at things in terms of 5 years and then there would be another ARC.
- **Response** – Ms. Sutton – There is no mandate to hold an ARC every 5 years.
- **Question** – Mr. Kardas – Due to the high renewal costs at St. Patrick's would we be prevented from keeping the school open?
- **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – No. Anything we can do to reduce that number would be looked on favourably

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

by the Ministry, but sometimes it reaches the point where it is no longer cost effective to do the repairs.

- Mr. Galloway we need to consider the strengths and concerns for the remaining options.

Consolidation at St. Patrick's	
Strengths	Concerns
Preserves the tradition/presence of a long-standing school community	Requires significant capital funding for both renewal and expansion
Has the lowest bussing requirements amongst any of the consolidation options	Site constraints could influence the scope of expansion and costs
Preserves proximity access to a premiere track facility	Could result in a loss of students from the north Sarnia area

- **Question** – Mr. Kardas – Due to the constant concern of losing students to the public board, and the number of students we lost when St. Helen's closed, is there anything in common with this review and the St. Helen's review?
- **Response** – Ms. Sutton – This accommodation review is a very different format from the St. Helen's format. This ARC is composed of members of the community who will make a judicious, studied response for the board to review. The only other review for this area, which has been conducted in this way, was the South Sarnia Elementary review process last year.
- Mr. McKenzie – The process has now changed and allows for greater community input, as the ARC members make recommendations, which are reviewed and considered by the Board of Trustees.

Consolidation at St. Christopher	
Strengths	Concerns
Good site in terms of accessing both the county and the city	Could result in some social/economic representation challenges within the Catholic students population; particularly from the south Sarnia area
Builds on a strong, contemporary facility in terms of an elevator, science labs, specialized spaces, etc.	There would be increased bussing requirements and associated costs
Would locate the high school in Sarnia's highest growth residential area	The location is not central to the city, which has the most significant population base
Represents a less costly capital development initiative	Potential loss of the history/tradition of St. Patrick's, depending on naming and other considerations

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

Sustain Current Two Schools with Upgrades	
Strengths	Concerns
Catholic presence remains strong, particularly in south Sarnia	If enrolment continues to decline at or near forecasted levels, both schools could fall below the 80% operational funding threshold, resulting in significant financial challenges for the Board to sustain the schools and for other commitments
Sustains known locations that have significant uniqueness and tradition	Significant capital costs to renew St. Patrick's and to develop any additions to one or both schools, if required
The two schools possibility could be themed/focused or develop specialties to differentiate them and to build/enhance curriculum capacities	Program concerns would continue emerge and become more significant as school enrolment falls.
Sustains the high pedestrian access currently in place at St. Patrick's, thus reducing overall bussing costs	
Could provide more extra curricular opportunities in terms of number of teams, clubs, etc.	
Could reduce the prospects of losing students to other boards, and may be a foundation to attract Catholic students back from the public school system	
The Magnet Program could continue and could be expanded to enrich overall curricular options and flexibility	

- **Question** – Fr. Matthew – are we looking at other alternatives of just looking at the strengths and concerns of Sustaining Current Two Schools with Upgrades?
- **Response** – Mr. Galloway – The options currently listed were brought forward by the ARC with input from the focus groups; however the ARC is free to consider other options.
- **Comment** – Fr. Matthew – We could also consider a two schools option, with each having a different focus, i.e., one for the arts and science and one for trades and technology.

ARC MEETING NOTES
Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

Develop a smaller school facility on the St. Patrick's site/Sustain St. Christopher	
Strengths	Concerns
Results in a new contemporary secondary school facility in South Sarnia, sized to enrolment projections	A short-term transitional move would be required during the redevelopment phase for construction
Continues the PEOPEL Program (this also could continued to be available in other scenarios)	Significant capital costs would be incurred to demolish and construct a new facility
Could preserve the tradition of the St. Patrick's school community	Possibility of curriculum and extra curricular limitations could evolve due to the small school population, especially if it was oriented towards students who walk, which could be in the 400-500 student range
	Does not address potential challenges if the St. Christopher enrolment falls below 80% in the 2013-2015 timeframe.
A new smaller St. Patrick's on a new site in South Sarnia/sustain St. Christopher	
Strengths	Concerns
The Board owns some properties in south Sarnia that possibly could be utilized, thus reducing capital costs	Proximity access to the track would be extended a further distance
Would not have to relocate students over a one or two year period to facilitate construction of a new facility	Does not address a potential enrolment decline challenge at St. Christopher if it falls below the 80% threshold in the 2013-2015 timeframe.
One School at St. Christopher with a Satellite Campus	
Strengths	Concerns
Would be cost more effective than a new build as board already owns sites	St. Patrick's track would not be on school site
Satellite campus in South Sarnia would provide presence in area.	Challenge to create a uniform student body
Cost saving as there would only be one set of administration.	Lack of identity and school spirit when two campuses are segregated.

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

- Mr. Galloway asked if the ARC wished to remove any of the remaining 6 options from consideration.
- Mr. Evers – the One School at St. Christopher with a Satellite Campus should be removed. Removed by consensus of the ARC.
- Ms. Brant – some of the alternatives revolve around cost and we don't have that information.
 - **Question** - Mr. Kardas – Do we know how many catholic students currently attend school in the public Board?
 - **Response** – Ms. Dolson – We do not have this information, as we are only able to track this information once students enter our system.
 - Ms. Sutton – We lose 25% to the public board from grade 8 to grade 9
 - **Question** – Fr. Matthew – Can we also look at the number of Catholics who attend public schools? Could the census be used to tabulate this information?
 - **Response** – Ms. Dolson – The board does not have those statistics and the census would not give an accurate representation.
 - Ms. Chynces – We need to look at the costs involved in the different options of renovating or building.

- **Question** – Mr. Galloway – What level of costing could be done for the different models?
- **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – Very high level estimates from architects which would not be all that accurate and would be a long process.
- Fr. Matthew – While we need to be cost conscious, fearing the cost too much may be detrimental to the decision which will be made.
- **Question** – Ms. Hayter – Was there a cost analysis done for the South Sarnia Elementary Schools?
- **Response** – Ms. Chynces – Some of the cost analysis was provided to the ARC. This ARC does need some idea of what these costs will be.
- **Question** – Mr. Galloway – Is it a preference of this ARC that some sort of cost analysis be provided to them?
- **Response** – Fr. Matthew – Yes, this would be a useful tool. It was the consensus of the ARC to ask the board to provide some type of cost analysis.
- **Question** – Ms. Hayter – Is it only the ARC who are permitted to ask questions?
- **Response** – Ms. Sutton – This portion of the meeting is for discussion by ARC members only; however, members of the public may ask questions at the end of the meeting.
- **Question** – Ms. Spanton – Where did the 8 million dollar cost for retrofit come from?
- **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – Most of it comes from the renewal data which is kept by the Ministry and we added some renewal costs which we know will have to be done i.e. HVAC mechanical system.
- **Question** – Ms. Etienne – By choosing any of the Two School Alternatives, what kind of programming will be at these smaller schools?

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

- **Response** – Ms. Courey – With a population of about 400 students at one of the schools programming would be very difficult. Some courses might have to be completed by students using a teleconferencing or e-learning system, which would create problems for students, who could not interact with teachers, as they do in a regular classroom. Some students in their senior year might not be able to take courses, which they would require for their post secondary education.
- Mr. Forster – With a smaller school there will be limits as to programming which could be offered to students with special needs.
- Mr. Kardas – It would appear that both Tier one decisions which are the strategic direction for the school and board and Tier two decisions which are cultural issues are both very important to make these decisions.
- **Question** – Mr. Kardas - Are we mandated to come up with a Tier one decision and then the board will decide the Tier two issues?
- **Response** – Mr. Galloway – You have a mandate to recommend a strategy and also to make other recommendations around that strategy.
- **Question** – Mr. Galloway – How do we address the possibility of St. Christopher falling below 80% capacity in the Two Schools options?
- **Response** – Fr. Matthew – We take comfort in knowing that we are just working with projections and that there is continued growth in that area.
- Ms. Chynces – We need to use the information we have received to make our decision.
- Mr. Galloway – The ARC is mandated to make strategic recommendations based on the best information we currently have.
- **Question** – Fr. Matthew – If the ARC makes a recommendation and the board decides on a different action, can we make a secondary recommendation to the board?
- **Response** – Mr. Galloway – Yes, it is possible for the ARC to make a recommendation and also a secondary recommendation.
- **Question** – Ms. Chynces – Do we have to make a recommendation at the next meeting or can this process go on longer?
- **Response** – Ms. Sutton – The process can be extended.
- **Question** – Mr. Kardas – When St. Christopher was built were the projected demographics considered for the next 5-10 years?
- **Response** – Mr. McKenzie – In the recent past school boards did not do a lot of work around projections. The capacity for data collection and review was not as well developed. It was a different time and things were viewed differently. It has only been in the recent past that many boards have begun to experience declining enrolment. At the time of the St. Christopher build, there was a huge capacity issue in Sarnia. There was a

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

	definite need for a second Catholic secondary school at the time. Enrolment began to decline subsequent to that decision.
	<p>Financial Framework Requested by ARC members</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr. Galloway – Does the ARC need more financial information and more programming information for the next meeting to enable us to come to a singular recommendation? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Question - Ms. Hayter – Could we have the financial information requested a couple of weeks prior to the next meeting in order to be able to process all the information? • Response – Ms. Sutton – The process time may be problematic but if the information is available prior to the next meeting it will be sent out by her office. • Question: Ms. Chynces – Do we have to make a decision at the next meeting? • Response: Ms. Sutton – We will take more time if needed. <p>The Financial Framework Requested would consist of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Include 5 remaining options: 2 consolidated options; 2 new building options and sustaining both school campuses. <p>Mr. Galloway reminded the ARC that eventually they need to get down to one clear option.</p>
9:45 p.m.	Decision to end meeting and to move remaining Agenda items to the next meeting Agenda
9:45 p.m.	<p>Presentation of the proposed agenda – May 5, 2009 – St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Proposed agenda for the May 5, 2009 ARC was presented by Ms. Sutton. ▪ Agenda will be modified to incorporate the parts of the March agenda not completed at tonight's meeting. ▪ The May 5, 2009 meeting may not be the final meeting.
9:50 p.m.	<p>Questions from student representatives (non-voting members)</p> <p>Question – <i>Brenda Thompson – St. Patrick's Catholic High School</i> No questions</p> <p>Question – <i>Jack Evers – St. Christopher Secondary School</i> No questions</p> <p>Questions from the floor.</p>

ARC MEETING NOTES
Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick's Catholic High School, Sarnia

Question – Michelle Lalonge-Davey - Parent

Has the hospital been involved in paying for any part of St. Patrick's parking lot restoration and if so is there any agreement in place for the hospital to buy the St. Patrick's property?

Answer – Mr. McKenzie - Work was done a number of years ago and hospital paid a significant portion of the cost. The agreement made was that the board would provide the hospital with 35 parking spaces and if we ever required those spaces back we would then need to pay the hospital for the number of parking spaces. There would be a financial obligation to the hospital if we change the use. There has not been any discussion of the hospital purchasing the school land.

Comment – Michelle Lalonge-Davey – Parent

Whatever recommendations the ARC may wish to make to Trustees, it is important to be mindful of the long-standing commitment in Catholic education to the inclusion of all learners.

Question – Pat Brown – Parent and Former Teacher

Is there any way that we can determine how much revenue the board would lose if one of the schools was to close?

Answer – Mr. McKenzie – Although a decline in student numbers is always viewed as a loss for our Board, in terms of revenue it is cost neutral, because as revenues decline with enrolment, so does cost, so that one is offset by the other.

Question – Pat Brown – Parent and Former Teacher

Is anyone in our board privy to any knowledge as to whether our co-terminus board is planning on having an ARC for the St. Clair Secondary School and SCITS?

Answer – Mr. McKenzie – not aware of any plans of that nature. Ms. Sutton - those decisions are made in public forum by board members at board meetings so it would be public knowledge.

Question – Frank Torti - Teacher

With reference to the number of students who left our system when St. Helen school closed, has there been any thought to polling the parents of both St. Christopher and St. Patrick's schools to ask if they would move to the public board if particular decisions are made.

Ms. Hayter – I asked if there could be a survey of the grade 7 and 8 feeder schools to see what their plans are.

Mr. Kardas - the notion of survey is interesting but caution needs to be exercised regarding a survey as this is such an emotional issue. Would people answer honestly or would they answer emotionally?

ARC MEETING NOTES

Tuesday, March 10, 2009
St. Patrick’s Catholic High School, Sarnia

	<p>Mr. Galloway – our firm and others do extensive professional survey work and some caution needs to be exercised because if it is not a random survey it becomes skewed. All the conditions would need to be known if you want to get an informed response.</p> <p><i>Answer – Ms. Sutton – this is not something that has been considered. Senior Administration would make the decision as to whether there would be this type of survey. The questions were asked during the focus groups and there did not seem to be an issue.</i></p> <p>Question – Frank Torti - Teacher How can we draw students to the Catholic board? Do you know roughly the number of students from the Public board who come to our Catholic secondary schools in Sarnia?</p> <p><i>Answer – Mr. Deery – St. Christopher had approximately 30 students transfer from the public board last year and about the same number this year. – Ms. Gray – St. Patrick’s had 14 or 15 with fluctuation during the school year. The demographics show that the number of young people in the core area of Sarnia has lessened in the past few years.</i></p>
<p>10:00 p.m.</p>	<p>Closing Prayer Ms. Sutton led the closing prayer.</p>
	<p>Future ARC Meeting Dates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tuesday, May 5, 2009 – St. Christopher Catholic Secondary School